

11/19/2024 Rubric is adapted from the Education Northwest 6+ Traits Writing Rubric and AP College Board Lang. and Comp. Rubric

MASONIC ESSAY CONTEST RUBRIC 2024

The 2024-2025 SENIOR ESSAY topic is: Presidential elections often include language filled with vitriol. When, if ever, does the quest to win an election at any cost outweigh the damage and disunity created by attack ad campaigns?

REQUIREMENTS		☐ Writer is a high school senior from public high school ☐ Essay is no more than 1,250 words, excluding Work Cited/Reference page ☐ Essay includes Works Cited/Reference Page ☐ Essay is student's original work (see below)				☐ Essay uses APA or MLA Style (not automatically dq) ☐ Essay is typed and double-spaced ☐ Essay is in English
ORIGINALITY	4	3	2	1	0	
View the originality report for each essay—check elements that are highlighted to ensure they are properly cited.	Essay uses supporting evidence that is accurately cited throughout (25% non-original max).	Essay uses accurately cited supporting evidence but quoted material may overwhelm writer's own points (26%-35%).	Essay is overwhelmed by evidence/ examples that are not original to the author—it is accurately cited (36-49%).	Majority of essay is from outside sources, not consistently cited, but writer provided little of their own thinking. (50-75%).	Essay shows signs of being almost entirely from outside sources and/or AI (75%-100%).	
If the writer does not meet above REQUIREMENTS OR scores a 1 or 0 on ORIGINALITY, DO NOT continue to score essay.						
CONTENT/IDEAS Thesis/Main Idea	4	3	2	1	0	
Evaluate the way the writer establishes their main point (thesis). The thesis should be identifiable throughout the essay.	Establishes a clear, focused, and significant main idea, with original insights, that is fully developed.	Communicates a solid, focused, and accurate main idea with adequate development. May not be as insightful as those essays rated a 4.	The writer's main point may be vague or merely a restatement of the prompt. Main idea may be unclear or underdeveloped.	Essay lacks a clear main idea/stand that controls the structure of the rest of the essay. There may be individual points but they do not cohere.	Essay does not advance a controlling main idea, point, or stand.	
Supporting Evidence	4	3	2	1	0	
How well does the writer support their main points—could be in the form of personal examples or researched examples (including statistics, quotations)	Supports the main idea convincingly, with highly specific, credible information and/or striking details that go beyond the obvious. Evidence is accurately cited using MLA or APA.	Supports the main idea with generally accurate, specific, and relevant information and/or details. There are parenthetical citations that are accurate but perhaps inconsistent.	Provides incidental or inconsistent support of main idea with information that lacks specificity, relevance, and/or accuracy. Evidence is not cited but may mention sources.	Attempts to support the main idea with some information and/ or details, but these are generic, unfocused, unclear, and/ or unrelated. There are no citations	Does not support a main idea with examples or evidence. There are no parenthetical citations or references to outside sources though there is a works cited/reference page.	

11/19/2024 Rubric is adapted from the Education Northwest 6+ Traits Writing Rubric and AP College Board Lang. and Comp. Rubric

Commentary	4	3	2	1	0
<i>Commentary refers to the sections of the essay where the writer connects evidence to the overall point they are making.</i>	Evidence/ examples are clearly explained and connected to the broader message/ thesis of the essay.	Explains how some of the evidence supports a line of reasoning . May be slightly inconsistent in developing ideas as they relate to the point.	Explains how some of the evidence relates to the argument, but may feel unclear or repetitive or formulaic .	There is little to no commentary on the evidence and/or the commentary is not developing content .	No explanation of evidence (perhaps because no evidence was introduced.)
ORGANIZATION	4	3	2	1	0
<i>How well does the writer organize the essay both overall and within paragraphs?</i>	Reflects smooth, cohesive organization and varied techniques that build to create a unified whole.	Includes basic organization that moves the reader through the text logically with minimal confusion.	Shows developing organization that is sporadic, hampering ability to follow text.	Uses mostly ineffective organization with only a few sections that direct reader.	No identifiable organization; writing lacks a sense of direction or seems random.
SENTENCE FLUENCY	4	3	2	1	0
<i>How easy is the essay to read—do sentences flow logically internally and to the next?</i>	Structures a variety of well-developed sentences that are rhythmic and flowing .	Structures varied sentences that are usually technically correct and flow smoothly .	Structures sentences that may be technically correct but not varied , sounding mechanical, awkward , or not smooth	Structures many sentences incorrectly , causing reader to stumble; repetitive structure.	Structures sentences incorrectly ; reader must reread text several times to comprehend.
VOICE			2	1	0
<i>Voice refers to the writer's unique personality and perspective that shines through in their writing. The tone and attitude they convey in their piece, makes it feel distinctly their own.</i>			Writer's personality comes through in their choice of diction, style, details, and tone . There is a distinctive voice that matches purpose, and audience . Consistent level of formality.	Reveals a little of the writer's personality . Perhaps the tone does not always fit with the style of the essay. Sometimes uses inappropriate level of formality .	Shows indifference or distance— no distinct personality is present . Writing feels generic . Level of formality does not match the purpose of the essay.
CONVENTIONS	4	3	2	1	0
<i>Refers to the use of standard punctuation, grammar, and spelling including typos.</i>	Demonstrates consistent use of correct conventions .	Uses correct conventions with some minor errors .	Shows inconsistency in use of correct conventions—may impair readability.	Includes many errors that make text difficult to read .	Contains numerous and varied errors that make text unreadable .